

Full Length Research Paper

Factors contributing to high Turnover of Health Workers, from Faith-Based Hospitals to Government Hospitals, A Case of St. Joseph Shelter of Hope Mission Hospital in Voi-Taita Taveta, County-Kenya

Nyongesa Wandera Margaret

The Technical University of Kenya (TUK)

*Corresponding author email: maggwande@gmail.com Phone: +254-722561826

Accepted 16 September, 2023

Human resources is one of the most important aspects of any healthcare system in all health systems, health workers command a significant share of health budgets, in some cases more than 75 percent. Turnover, is defined as people who have left, are leaving, and intend to leave for various reasons. The study seeks to establish the factors contributing to a high turnover of health workers from faith-based hospitals to government hospitals. Descriptive cross-sectional research design was used where quantitative data was collected. The study populations included health workers at the facility of 100 staff. The study conducted a census of all respondents. Purposive sampling methods were used to select staff to be interviewed. Structured questionnaires were self-administered to all respondents. Data was checked and analyzed using SPSS version 23 and presented in percentage, frequency, tables and graphs. The finding shows that lack of financial compensation, working environment, motivation, and job security had a significant influence on the high turnover of health workers seeking opportunities in government hospitals. Recommendation, Organizations to develop strategies that creates a friendly environment and job security by providing good package including provident and other benefits to create job security that will reduce health worker turnover from Faith-based to government. Management support is a critical determinant of staff turnover in the health care sector.

Keywords: Faith-Based Hospitals, Government Hospitals, Job Satisfaction, Turnover, Health Workers.

INTRODUCTION

Turnover is defined as people who have left, are leaving, and intend to leave for various reasons (Chepchumba and kimutai 2017). Human resources is one of the most important aspects of any healthcare system in all health systems, health workers command a significant share of health budgets, in some cases more than 75 percent. In the lowest-income countries, staff costs typically exceed two-thirds of the public health budget; the share is likely similar in the private sector (HRH Report 2004). Health workers are one of the most important building blocks of the health system without which global and national efforts to achieve health-related goals cannot be reached to the set targets. Health workforce shortage and retention problems have been the major challenges in the health sector (Yumkella, 2009). Globally, it was estimated there to be a deficit of about 7.2 million health

professionals which could increase twofold in the next few decades. Turnover is defined as people who have left, are leaving, and intend to leave for various reasons (Chepchumba and kimutai, 2017). Variations in intent to stay among professional groups may shed light on underlying mechanisms, as well as those specific to professional groups or those more particularly linked to institutional context or culture (Gilles, 2014).

It can be either voluntary or involuntary. Existing studies confirmed that actual turnover can be best predicted by studying the employee's intent to leave their current organization.

Human Resource for Health inequities showed that America has 17 % world's population compared to sub-Saharan Africa with 9 % of the world population but Sub-Saharan Africa carries 26 % of the global disease burden

and Americans take 10 % of the global disease burden. Further, America has the global health workers of 42 % compared with Sub-Saharan Africa with only global health workers of only 3%. Equally, Americans allocate 50 % of their annual expenditure to health as compared to Sub-Saharan Africa with less than 1 % annual budgetary allocation to health (WHO, 2017). The worker shortfall and global disease burden are more prominent in Africa, particularly sub-Saharan countries, having the least health worker to population ratio, which is not sufficient to meet the needs of the rapidly growing population. Ethiopia, despite having the highest number of health workers from sub-Saharan Africa, has been suffering from the human resource health crisis. (Feysia, *et al.*, 2012). The national estimated density of health workers (0.84 per 1000 population) and the distribution of physicians (0.03 per 1000 population) showed the lowest thresholds with less likely feasibility of achieving the minimum possible threshold of worker density necessary to attain the set health system goals.

Buchan (2010) found that Personnel turnover poses a significant problem through the loss of trained Health workers at St. Joseph Shelter of Hope (SJSHope) Hospital and is even more problematic when the supply of such skilled and knowledgeable Health workers at SJSHope Hospital is limited, thus leading to a permanent loss of productivity. Job satisfaction and its particular dimensions such as work nature, work environment, autonomy, supervision, remunerations, and peer group relationships are among the major predictors.

Loss of experienced Health workers at SJSHope Hospital with their valuable knowledge is followed by extensive costs imposed on the organization for communicating job vacancies, recruitment, selection, hiring, and retraining purposes (Ferede, *et al.* 2018) this in turn can reduce organizational performance and employee productivity. In addition, it disrupts the performance and morale of the remaining staff and increases their workload, resulting in additional burdens. Moreover, the quality of health care services would be compromised leading to unfavorable patient outcomes (Waldman, 2011). Ferede, *et al.* (2018) finding indicates that The magnitude of turnover intention was high among health professionals working in public health institutions of North Shoa Zone. Health service managers and policymakers should develop evidence based retention strategies considering the determinants of health professionals' intention to leave.

The most common reason for the employee turnover rate being so high is the salary scale because Health workers at (SJSHope Hospital are usually in search of jobs that pay well. Those who are desperate for a job may take the first one that comes along to carry them through while searching for better paying employment. Low pay is a good reason as to why an employee may be lacking in performance, (Rampur, 2009). Unequal or substandard wage structures fall under this category as

well. When two or more Health workers at SJSHope Hospital perform similar work and have similar responsibilities, differences in pay rate can drive lower paid Health workers at SJSHope Hospital to quit, it also leads to a lack of motivation. In a similar vein, if you pay less than other employers for similar work, Health workers at SJSHope Hospital are likely to jump ship for higher pay, if other factors are relatively equal, (Scarpello and Carraher, 2008). According to Laser, (2008), most people feel that the major cause of employee turnover is the issue of salary. While there is some support for this view, its importance has been greatly exaggerated; it is 3 widely held because individuals frequently cite salary as their reason for leaving, making the organization and its pay scale a convenient target for employee frustrations.

According to Lloyd and Mertens (2018), the expectancy theory is scientific as it clarifies concepts surrounding effort, performance and motivation. The validity of the theory is diminished by the fact that organizations compensate employees according to skills, effort, job complexity and seniority. Departments needs to increase human labor allocation, salaries, benefits, and awards to accommodate their morale to work because as of now it is clear that health workers are not compensated as per their output. The individual with too little is likely to feel humiliated and upset while the individual who gets too much may feel guilty (Ederer and Manso, 2013).

Ahmed, *et al.*, (2016) carried out a research study. The outcomes of the research revealed that voluntary turnover leaves the organization with big direct expenses relating to recruitment, selection, and time which have an unfavorable effect on the effectiveness of the staff members. Buchan (2010) paper examined the issue of workforce stability and turnover in the context of policy attempts to improve retention of health workers. The paper argues that there are significant benefits to supporting policy makers and managers to develop a broader perspective of workforce stability and methods of monitoring it. Humphreys, *et al.*, (2017) conducted a study on Retention Strategies and Incentives for Health Workers in Rural and Remote Areas, found that engagement with key stakeholders to identify continuing Professional development priorities can help facilitate strategic planning and provision of relevant and accessible CPD programmes for staff working within remote and rural health care contexts in to reduce staff turnover.

METHODOLOGY

Study Site

The study was conducted at St Joseph Shelter of Hope (SJSHope) mission hospital which is situated in Coastal Region, Taita Taveta County in Voi Sub-County, Kenya. Voi Sub-County has a population of 111,831 and Taita Taveta County has a population of 340,671 according to

Table 1. Motivation

Stratum	Respondents	Percentage (%)	
You feel motivated at place of work	Always	8	9
	Sometimes	28	31
	Not at All	54	60
You are comfortable with your pay and benefits	Always	10	11
	Sometimes	18	20
	Not at All	62	69
How happy do you feel coming to work	Always	14	16
	Sometimes	20	22
	Not at All	56	62

Table 2. Working Environment

Stratum	Respondents	Percentage (%)	
Do you feel the working environment is healthy	Yes	1	16
	No	82	84

Kenya's national population census of 2019. SJSHope is approximately 2Km from Voi Town St. Joseph Shelter of Hope (SJSHope) is a registered Faith Based Non-Governmental Organization (NGO) that was established in 1999 and is under the leadership of the General Council of Sisters of St. Joseph, Archdiocese of Mombasa.

Study design

A descriptive cross-sectional study design was used where quantitative methods was applied for data collection.

Study population

The study population was composed of health workers at SJSHope Hospital population of 100 staff. The study conducted a census of all respondents.

Data Collection Tools and Methods

The study used both primary and secondary data. Primary quantitative data was collected by use of structured questionnaires to collect information from the health workers. Using a self-administered questionnaire. The interview guide was used to collect information from the head of departments. The questionnaire comprised self-enumeration matrix questions rated on a Likert scale. Secondary data were obtained from existing records at the facility and other official statistics for the purpose to enrich the data.

Data Analysis

Data obtained was analyzed using descriptive statistics

by using SPSS version 23. Results were presented in tables and graphic forms using percentages and frequencies.

RESULTS

Motivation for Turnover of Health Workers

The results show that 60% of respondents felt that there is no motivation at all while 69% they are not comfortable with the pay and benefits they receive at all and 62% are not happy working at SJSHope Hospital as indicated in the Table 1.

Working Environment on Turnover of Health Workers

The results indicated that on the working environment (84%) responded that the working environment was not healthy and conducive, while (16%) supported that the working environment was healthy and conducive Table 2.

Financial Compensation on Turnover of Health Workers.

The results on financial compensation show that (67%) are not satisfied with salaries, (69%) felt that the departments are understaffed, (63%) responded that rewards are not given in fairness to all staff and (64%) are not comfortable with working hours Table 3.

High Turnover of Health Workers

High turnover is highly experienced at the St. Joseph Shelter of Hope Hospital, and the respondents were asked to give a verdict on its ultimate cause as part of the questionnaire they were asked whether the level of

Table 3. Financial Compensation

Stratum	Respondents	Percentage (%)	
Health workers are satisfied with the salaries and bonuses they receive	Always	10	11
	Sometimes	20	22
	Not at All	60	67
You are satisfied with the number of employees in your department	Always	8	9
	Sometimes	20	22
	Not at All	62	69
The rewards are handled in the same way for all employees	Always	12	13
	Sometimes	22	24
	Not at All	56	63
You are comfortable with your working hours	Always	8	9
	Sometimes	24	27
	Not at All	58	64

Table 4. High Turnover of Health Workers experienced at SJSHope Hospital

Stratum	Respondents	Percentage (%)
Yes	72	80
No	18	20
Total	90	100

financial compensation, motivation, and working environment has a significant influence on high turnover of health workers and the finding was 80% respondent yes and 20% no.

High Turnover of Health Workers experienced at SJSHope Hospital

Many respondents (80%) stated that financial compensation, motivation, working environment, and job insecurity have a significant influence on high health worker turnover from faith-based to government hospitals only (20%) of respondents did not support the above variables Table 4.

Working Environment on Turnover of Health Workers

The results on the working environment show that (84%) of respondents agree that the working environment is not healthy and conducive, while (16%) support that the working environment was healthy and conducive.

DISCUSSIONS

Management support is a critical determinant of labour turnover in the health sector, it is clear that financial compensation is a factor to be looked into. The findings of this study concur with Rampur, (2009) that Low pay is a good reason as to why an employee may be lacking in performance and opting to leave. Departments need to increase human labor allocation, salaries, benefits, and

awards to accommodate their morale to work because as of now it is clear that health workers are not compensated as per their output. According to Lloyd and Mertens (2018), the expectancy theory is scientific as it clarifies concepts surrounding effort, performance and motivation. The validity of the theory is diminished by the fact that organizations compensate employees according to skills, effort, job complexity and seniority. This suggests reasons why SJSHope Hospital is experiencing a high turnover of health workers. A clear compensation strategy can eliminate arbitrary salary decisions, and ensure employees are fairly compensated and valued. What can't be matched dollar-to-dollar can be offset by pulling other levers, including flexibility, benefits, perks, growth opportunities, etc. Introducing transparent policies and programs that reflect SJSHope Hospital Health Worker needs makes it known that they're understood, heard and valued. The results concur with the findings of Momanyi and Kaimenyi (2015) that showed that supervisory elements contribute to staff turnover, promotion practices and efficiency of personnel development programs were positively related to staff turnover. Equitable compensation among staff is very important for, consideration, since the individual with too little is likely to feel humiliated and upset while the individual who gets too much may feel guilty (Ederer and Manso, 2013).

Ahmed *et.,al* (2016) carried out a research study. The outcomes of the research study revealed that voluntary turnover leaves the organization with big direct expenses relating to recruitment, selection and time which have an unfavorable effect on the effectiveness of the staff members. This agrees Pattni (2018) who performed a research study to examine the factors of worker turnover and its outcome on organizational effectiveness of building up the capacity of the work environment as a contributing component to worker turnover this supports the finding of the current study that working environment leads to job dissatisfaction that contributes to staff turnover. Arnoux *et al.*, 2018 conducted study on the

meaning of work as a mediator of the relationships between adverse working conditions and turnover intentions. The mediating effect of meaning of work was clearly demonstrated for four adverse working conditions (i.e., lack of resources, organizational changes, lack of personal development, and personal reasons).

CONCLUSION ON FINDING

Respondents indicated that lack of financial compensation, working environment, and motivation had a significant influence on the high turnover of health workers at SJSHope Hospital.

1. Lack of financial compensation health workers to become stressed financially, and their health and productivity can both suffer.
2. The working environment is another factor that needs to be dealt with, Health worker's productivity and performance can decrease due to a poorly planned workplace environment as this adversely affects their morale and may give rise to poor motivation and no job satisfaction as a result hence being a contributing factor for health workers to resign, a proper, helpful, conducive workplace environment brings improvements to the employees' physical and mental capabilities in performing their daily routine.
3. Financial compensation, motivation working environment, and job insecurity have a significant influence on to high turnover of health workers.

RECOMMENDATIONS

Organizations to develop strategies to reduce health worker turnover in the workplace and management factors, promotion practices, good working environment, staff development practices, and reward practices must be considered.

Management at SJSHope Hospital should recognize and support health workers in order to improve satisfaction/retention.

SJSHope Hospital should consider improving terms of service (salaries and allowances) to be comparable with other similar institutions or governments. Such issues like performance appraisals, advancement opportunities, recognition, responsibility and achievement, to prevent feelings of being in dead-end jobs influencing high health workers turnover rate.

The SJSHope Hospital needs to develop strong human resource strategies for health worker—retention to enhance patient care and reduce health workers' replacement costs and training.

They further recommended that, to increase the motivation and job satisfaction of health workers, there should be emphasis on an enabling environment for example through listening to and acting on staff problems and priorities or fostering team building.

They may also engage in assisting the career planning

and paths of their subordinates. In-service training that is focused on the expressed needs of health workers should be conducted. A supportive supervision system should also be developed that includes experienced and dedicated health workers as supervisors to ensure consistent production and the best customer service.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

sincerely express my gratitude to the staff of St. Joseph Shelter of Hope Hospital Voi for their willingness to participate in this study and all the support during the research period. More so, I greatly appreciate all those who spared time to support especially the research assistants and all respondents. And above all, the One who gives wisdom and strength, the Almighty God.

REFERENCES.

- Ahmed Z, Sabir S, Khosa M, Ahmad I, Bilal M (2016). Impact of Employee Turnover on Organizational Effectiveness in Tele Communication Sector of Pakistan. *IOSR J. Bus. Manage.*, 18(11): 88-96.
- Arnourx-Nicolas C, Sovet L, Čulibrk J, Delić M, Mitrović S, Čulibrk D (2018). Job satisfaction, organizational commitment and job involvement: The mediating role of job involvement. *Frontiers in psychology.*, 9:132.
- Buchan J (2010). Reviewing the benefits of health workforce stability. *Human resources for health*, 8(1):1-5.
- Chepchumba, TR, and Kimutai BD (2017). The relationship between employee compensation and employee turnover in small businesses among Safaricom dealers in Eldoret municipality, Kenya. *Int. J. Econ. Comm. Manage.*, 5(2): 490-501.
- Ederer F, Manso G (2013). Is Pay-for-Performance Detrimental to Innovation? *Management Science.*, 59, 1496-1513
- Ferede A, Getiye DK, Million Y, Simeneh M, Belay YA, Hailemariam D (2018). Magnitude of turnover intention and associated factors among health professionals working in public health institutions of North Shoa zone, Amhara Region, Ethiopia. *BioMed Res. Int.*
- Gilles I, Burnand B, Peytremann-bridevaux I (2014). Factors associated with healthcare professionals 'intent to stay in hospital: a comparison across five occupational categories., 26(2): 158–166.
- Humphreys J, Wakerman J, Pashen D, Buykx P (2017). Retention strategies and incentives for health workers in rural and remote areas: what works?
- Lloyd R, Mertens D (2018). Expecting more out of Expectancy Theory: History urges inclusion of the social context. *Int. Manage. Rev.*, 14(1):28-43.
- Momanyi N, Kaimenyi C (2015). An investigation into factors causing high nurse turnover in Mission Hospitals in Kenya: A case for Pcea Chogoria Hospital. *Int. J. Acad. Res. Bus. Soc. Sci.*, 5(3): 55-63.

Pattni B (2018). Determinants of employee turnover and its effect on organizational performance-A Case of Airtel Kenya Limited (Doctoral dissertation, Strathmore University).

Rampur S (2009). Causes of Employee Turnover. Retrieved, from Buzzle.com: <http://www.buzzle.com/articles/causes-of-employeeturnover.html>

WHO (2017). Domestic resource mobilization for sustainable financing for health in Africa.

Yumkella F (2009). Retention of health workers in low-resource settings: challenges and responses. Technical brief No. 1. Chapel Hill, NC: Capacity Project. Available: http://www.capacityproject.org/images/stories/files/techbrief_1.pdf